

**Original Article**

# **INADEQUATE HUMAN RESOURCES AND THEIR EFFECT ON THE SERVICE DELIVERY OF ADAMAWA STATE PRIMARY HEALTH CARE DEVELOPMENT AGENCY**

***Hassan Adebayo Ibrahim***

College of Health Technology, Adamawa State University

DOI: <https://doi.org/10.5281/zenodo.13798833>

**Abstract:** The effect of inadequate human resources on performance of Adamawa state primary health care Development agency, is very crucial for Effective delivery of Health care services the research is to investigated the effect of human resources inadequacy on work load of staff of the agency, personnel inadequacy impact the job satisfaction of employees at Adamawa State Primary Health Care Development Agency between 2015 and 2020, relationship between human resource inadequacy, the training and development of staff at Adamawa State Primary Health Care Development Agency. The research employed both qualitative and quantitative method of data analysis using regression and correlation analysis. the analysis revealed that a significant proportion of respondents perceived negative effects across various dimensions like timely access to care, patient outcomes, patient satisfaction, availability of essential equipment, and communication. This suggests inadequacy of staff training and development in Adamawa State Primary Health Care Development Agency, as well evaluate the financial implications of human resource inadequacy on Agency Operations. The study concluded that lack of staff training and development, as well as paucity of financial significantly compromised the performance of the Primary Health Care Development Agency from 20152020 across multiple domains. Personnel shortages had widespread detrimental effects on healthcare service access, quality, delivery, utilization, patient satisfaction, health outcomes and system productivity, and suggest that personnel shortages compromised quality, and therefore recommended that improve funding and investment into health workers training, compensation and benefit to attract and retain personnel.

**Keywords:** Inadequate, Human Resource, Performance, Agency

## **Original Article**

### **Introduction**

The health system in Adamawa State has been in persistent decline over the past few years, with lack of adequate human resource, poor recruitment process, lack of staff development and proper management resultant poor performance and the enduring burden of disease and poor health indicative of the alarming health status indicators as reported under the (2013 DHS Survey). Despite the application of technology in modern organizational management. In Adamawa State human resources are relevant and most adaptive resources of any organization. The strategic value of human resources stems from the fact that apart from other resources employed in the course of production (land, capital, technology etc) which are passive, human resources are endowed with discretionary decision-making power, and thus, have competitive advantage over the other sources in the right mix to formulate appropriate strategies for the accomplishment of desired objectives of the enterprise (Ademolekun, 1983).

In Adamawa State Primary Health Care Development Agency, human resource administration relates to the overall organization planning process by which the organization tries to ensure that it has the right number of persons and right kind of work force, at the right time and at the right place performing functions, which are economically useful and which satisfy the needs of the organization and provides satisfaction for the individual involved. However, there are challenges in finding and maintaining a qualified workforce to achieving the predetermined objectives of the Primary Health Care Development Agency.

It is against the foregoing that the study will examine the effects of inadequate human resources in Adamawa State Primary Health Care Development Agency with emphasis on three Local Government Areas.

### **1.2 Problem Statement**

The overall HRH picture in Adamawa is inconsistent and lacks integrity as HR information and data collection are fragmented and incomplete, with various stakeholders collecting and collating bits and pieces in the absence of any common data source or Human Resource Management Information System (HRMIS).

Production of health professionals are not related to the requirements of the State, as there is no mechanism in place to inform health training institution intake and output targets on the basis of service demand and staffing projections. There are systemic deficiencies in the planning, management, development and administration of the health workforce. This is as according to WHO (2022), every primary health center is supposed to have twenty-one (21) health care workers, which comprised of one (1) Community Health Officer, one-two (1-2) Community Health Extension Workers, six-three (3-6) Junior Community Health Extension Workers, four (4) Medical Laboratory Technician, two-five Pharmacy Technician, and two-six

(2-6) Midwives. But from available records, some health centers sampled have four to six (4-6) health care workers only e.g Mbaklgare (Mayo-Belwa, L.G.A) has four (4), Gude (MubiSouth, L.G.A) has four (4), and Chigari (Fufure, L.G.A) has four (4), among others (Adeniji, Adejobi, & Dedeke, 2019).

It is against these bases that the study will examine the effect of inadequate human resources personnel in Adamawa State Primary Health Care Development Agency with emphasis on three Local Government Areas.

**Objectives of the Study**      The objectives of this research were to:

i. To Explore the link between Human resource inadequacy and Staff Training and

Development of staff of Adamawa State Primary Health Care Development Agency ii. To Evaluate the Financial Implications of Human resource inadequacy on Agency Operations.

## **Original Article**

### **Scope of the Study**

The study's timeframe spans from 2015 to 2020. This period was chosen because the DHS report from 2013 to 2015 indicated that health activities, including immunization, antenatal care, and child welfare, consistently fell below expected targets within the Adamawa State Primary Health Care Development Agency.

### **Literature Review**

Human resources encompass individuals employed by an organization to perform various tasks. According to the Encyclopedia (2009), human resources range from unskilled laborers hired for daily contracts to highly skilled professionals like doctors working in hospitals. The significance of personnel in achieving organizational objectives cannot be overstated, as emphasized by Onah (cited in Ezeani and Nwanko, 2002). Essential processes such as goal setting, investment decisions, task delegation, equipment maintenance, and more are primarily carried out by organizational personnel. Therefore, people serve as the primary instruments for realizing organizational goals. Ofoegbu (1985) noted that while a firm may gather all its capital inputs, operational success ultimately hinges on personnel decisions. The assembly of production factors into a functional system is inherently a human endeavor, driven by human ingenuity and effort. At the organizational level, personnel are collectively referred to as human resources, as explained by Audu and Tolu (2015), Human resources encompass the diverse capabilities of individuals employed or available for employment within an organization, influencing the quantity and quality of output they can achieve.

Onah (2008) noted that an organization's efficiency largely hinges on the management and utilization of its human resources. Effective managers must possess the ability to work collaboratively with people and address the diverse challenges inherent in people management. He observed that the leadership style prevalent in organizations during the first half of the 20th century is no longer viable in today's working environment. This leadership approach was characterized by arbitrariness and autocracy in dealings with subordinates.

In contemporary times, significant shifts have occurred. Employees are now better educated, and their values and orientations differ from those of previous generations. Moreover, organizations are increasingly complex, necessitating leaders with enhanced technical competencies and a deeper understanding of human behavior. Recently, organizational human resources have garnered strategic interest from top management, recognizing that leveraging people effectively can confer a competitive edge.

Human resources are widely acknowledged as the most crucial among the resources essential for producing goods and services. They serve as the linchpin for rapid socioeconomic development and efficient service provision. According to Efe and Efe, (2014), human resources encompass the entirety of individuals' experiences, skills, judgments, abilities, knowledge, contracts, risk-taking, and wisdom within an organization. Without a skilled and motivated workforce supported by robust human resource management practices, achieving development goals and ensuring efficient service delivery remains unattainable.

The term "human resources" is commonly used to denote organizational personnel, and consequently, "human resource management" is frequently employed to describe the management of the human aspect of organizational operations. It is imperative, as noted by Efe and Efe, (2014), to grasp the connotations of these concepts, which have gained prominence in today's workplace management discourse.

## **Original Article**

Humans possess a reservoir of timeless knowledge, skills, and capabilities. However, as rational and emotional beings, their willingness to contribute towards organizational objectives is influenced by various factors. Additionally, individuals differ in the type and extent of knowledge, skills, and capabilities they possess. Human resources, therefore, encompass all individuals since each person possesses some form of knowledge, skill, or capability that can contribute productively.

The success of an organization hinges largely on its people. Hence, organizations must attract, retain, and motivate the right individuals to ensure they contribute their best efforts towards achieving organizational goals. Human resource management thus encompasses a set of organizational activities aimed at attracting, developing, and retaining an effective workforce. This topic will be further explored in the following segment, following the evaluation and review of management concepts.

According to Okoli (2000) “rarely, if ever has new basic institutions or new leading group, a new central function emerge as fast as has management since the turn of the country. In this study our emphasis is on personnel management.

Ubeku (1976) defined a manager as someone who, through guidance, leadership, encouragement, and motivation, enables the individuals in his team to achieve desired results. This implies that within any organization, for management to attain its goals, there must be a deliberate arrangement for someone to provide guidance, leadership, encouragement, and motivation to the workers to work towards the desired objectives. These constitute the fundamental tasks of personnel management.

Similarly, Nwachukwu (1988) echoed Ubeku's assertion, stating that when people collaborate to achieve predetermined objectives, there is a need for management tasked with ensuring the realization of the organization's aims and objectives. Whenever individuals come together to pursue a common goal, a leader naturally emerges to oversee the work, make final decisions, and ensure adherence to rules.

### **Theoretical Framework**

This research adopted the Bureaucratic theory as stipulated by Weber, 1864 cited in Egbe, 2002, Weber's “ideal” bureaucracy is characterized by the following principles.

- i. Fixed rules and regulations that guide appointment to any role in the hierarchy.
- ii. A clear vision of labor, which means that the occupant of each role must be competent and skilled to perform his duties diligently.
- iii. In discharging his responsibilities, the public official must separate his personal interest from that of the organization. He must therefore, deal with client without fear or favor and the official rules and regulations must be his only guide.
- iv. All activities carried out in the discharge of his responsibilities must be properly documented and kept as official records that could be referred to from time to time.
- v. A means of compensating the public official financially must be evolved as compensation for his devotion to the organization. This takes the form of salary and wages while on active service and pension and gratuity when he retires from active service. (Anifowose et al, 1999-276-277).

There is no doubt weber's model has been greeted by some critique. But even if it has to be argued that weber's model of rational legal bureaucracy is too rigid for a Federal structure like Nigeria with variegated idiosyncrasies, as Riggs, (Cole, 2002) contends that Weber's ideal type construct of bureaucracy assumes a relative administrative

## Original Article

system and may not be particularly relevant to the study of developing societies. Riggs suggests that development administration, rather than bureaucratic models, should be adopted for developing countries. However, in their attempt to justify their criticisms, proponents of development administration propose a system that unfortunately lacks sufficient autonomy from other social structures in developing countries, whereas in advanced or developed societies, such structures enjoy comparatively more autonomy.

Despite Riggs' criticisms of Weber's ideal bureaucracy, its capacity cannot be overlooked. Bureaucracy still stands as the most effective method and guide for organizations dealing with multiple languages and religions. Hiring the most qualified individuals into the civil service, regardless of their locality or religion, can facilitate improved implementation of government policies and programs, leading to satisfaction among all citizens and garnering mass support for government actions. Therefore, there is a need to shift away from prevailing principles that promote sectionalism and favoritism, and instead, emphasize the age-old philosophy of excellence, competence, qualification, and merit (Ndiomu, 1992).

### Methods of Data Analysis

This study utilized both qualitative and quantitative methods of data analysis to effectively address the research questions and fulfill its objectives. The statistical techniques employed included descriptive statistics and inferential statistics. Let's delve into each of these methods in detail:

### Descriptive Statistics

**Table 1.1: Demographic Information of the Respondents**

S/N	Description	Frequency	Percentage (%)
<b>1.</b>	<b>Gender of the respondents</b>		
1	Male	96	67
2	Female	48	33
	<b>Total</b>	144	100
<b>2.</b>	<b>Age of the respondents</b>		
1	18 – 24 years	24	17
2	25 – 34 years	48	33
3	35 – 44 years	36	25
4	45 – 54 years	24	17
5	55 – 65 years	12	8
	<b>Total</b>	144	100
<b>3.</b>	<b>Years of Experience</b>		
1	0 - 1 year	12	8
2	1 -2 years	24	17
3	3 – 5 years	48	33
4	6 – 10 years	36	25
5	10 – 35 years	24	17
	<b>Total</b>	144	100

Source: Computed using SPSS 24 from field survey data 2023

Original Article

The table provides insights into the gender distribution, age distribution, and years of experience of the participants. This information is crucial for understanding the characteristics of the sample population and how they might influence the study's findings. Gender distribution revealed that among the 144 respondents, 67% were male, while 33% were female. This distribution suggests that the study managed to capture a relatively balanced representation of both genders. The relatively higher proportion of male respondents might reflect the gender distribution within the health care workforce during the specified period.

In terms of age distribution, the respondents were divided into several age categories. The largest group was within the age range of 25 to 34 years, constituting 33% of the participants. This suggests that the agency's workforce had a significant representation of individuals in their mid-20s to mid-30s. The distribution indicates a diverse age range among the respondents, with individuals aged 55 and above constituting the smallest group at 8%. This diversity in age might imply varying levels of experience and perspectives among the participants.

The years of experience among the respondents shed light on the expertise and tenure of the workforce. The data indicates that the largest group had 3 to 5 years of experience, making up 33% of the respondents. This suggests a substantial portion of relatively mid-level experienced staff in the agency. Notably, those with 6 to 10 years of experience also constituted a significant portion at 25%. This indicates a sizeable segment of the workforce that had gained considerable experience in their roles. The distribution also reflects a relatively balanced representation across the experience spectrum, including those with less than 1 year and more than 10 years of experience. The demographic information presented in Table 1.1 provides valuable insights into the composition of the respondents participating in the study. The gender distribution suggests a balanced representation, while the age distribution showcases a diverse range of ages, and the years of experience distribution reveals varying levels of expertise within the agency's workforce. These demographic factors could potentially influence the outcomes of the study by reflecting different perspectives and experiences related to the effect of inadequate human resource on the agency's performance during the specified time frame (2015-2020).

Table 2.1: Relationship Between Human Resource Inadequacy and Staff Training and Development

Item	SD	(%)	D	(%)	N	(%)	A	(%)	SA	(%)	Total
The training and development opportunities provided by the agency during 2015-2020 were beneficial for my job.	18	12.5	24	16.7	48	33.3	42	29.2	12	8.3	144
The training and development programs were well-aligned with my job responsibilities and career goals during 2015-2020.	24	16.7	24	16.7	42	29.2	48	33.3	6	4.2	144
Lack of staffing significantly hindered my participation in training and development programs during 2015-2020.	6	4.2	12	8.3	18	12.5	60	41.7	48	33.3	144



Original Article

I was able to effectively apply the knowledge gained from training and development in my daily tasks during 2015-2020.	30	20.8	48	33.3	36	25.0	24	16.7	6	4.2	144
After participating in training and development, I received adequate feedback and support from supervisors during 2015-2020.	42	29.2	48	33.3	36	25.0	12	8.3	6	4.2	144

Source: Field Survey, 2023

Table 2.1 presents the analysis of the relationship between human resource inadequacy and the training and development of staff at the Adamawa State Primary Health Care Development Agency between the years 2015 and 2020. The table addresses the research question: "Is there a relationship between human resource inadequacy and the training and development of staff?". The analysis of training and development opportunities and their benefits for employees' jobs is an important consideration. The table reveals that 29.2% of respondents "Agreed" and 8.3% "Strongly Agreed" that the training and development opportunities provided by the agency during 2015-2020 were beneficial for their jobs. An additional 33.3% "Disagreed," indicating a substantial portion of participants who did not find these opportunities as beneficial.

Alignment of training and development programs with job responsibilities and career goals is crucial. The analysis demonstrates that 33.3% of respondents "Agreed" and 4.2% "Strongly Agreed" that the training and development programs were well-aligned with their job responsibilities and career goals during the specified years. Furthermore, 16.7% "Disagreed," highlighting a portion of participants who did not perceive a strong alignment. The impact of staffing shortages on participation in training and development programs is a significant concern. The analysis indicates that 41.7% of respondents "Agreed" and 33.3% "Strongly Agreed" that the lack of staffing significantly hindered their participation in training and development programs during the specified years. Additionally, 12.5% "Disagreed," suggesting that some participants did not attribute their participation challenges solely to personnel shortages.

Effective application of knowledge gained from training and development is essential for program efficacy. The analysis reveals that 33.3% of respondents "Agreed" and 20.8% "Strongly Agreed" that they were able to effectively apply the knowledge gained from training and development in their daily tasks during the specified years. Moreover, 16.7% "Disagreed," indicating a portion of participants who faced difficulties in applying the acquired knowledge. The feedback and support received from supervisors after participating in training and development is a vital component. The analysis shows that 33.3% of respondents "Agreed" and 29.2% "Strongly Agreed" that they received adequate feedback and support from supervisors after participating in training and development during the specified years. However, 33.3% "Disagreed," highlighting a substantial portion of participants who did not perceive sufficient feedback and support. The table illustrates that respondents perceived various effects of personnel inadequacy on the benefits of training, alignment with job responsibilities and goals, participation challenges, knowledge application, and supervisor feedback. These findings underscore the

Original Article

importance of addressing staffing constraints to enhance the effectiveness of training and development initiatives and overall employee growth.

Table 2.2: Impact of Human Resource Inadequacy on Financial Performance

Item	SD	(%)	D	(%)	N	(%)	A	(%)	SA	(%)	Total
The shortage of human resource had a negative impact on the agency's financial performance during 2015-2020.	6	4.2	12	8.3	24	16.7	54	37.5	48	33.3	144
I was satisfied with the agency's financial management and resource allocation during 2015-2020.	48	33.3	60	41.7	24	16.7	6	4.2	6	4.2	144
Financial constraints due to staffing shortages affected the acquisition of essential medical supplies and equipment during 2015-2020.	12	8.3	18	12.5	30	20.8	48	33.3	36	25.0	144
Lack of staffing led to increased costs or inefficiencies in agency operations during 2015-2020.	18	12.5	24	16.7	36	25.0	42	29.2	24	16.7	144

Source: Field Survey, 2023

Table 2.2 presents the analysis of the impact of human resource inadequacy on the financial performance of the Adamawa State Primary Health Care Development Agency between the years 2015 and 2020. The table addresses the research question: "What impact does human resource inadequacy have on the financial performance of the agency?" The negative impact of personnel shortages on the agency's financial performance is a critical concern. The analysis reveals that 37.5% of respondents "Agreed" and 33.3% "Strongly Agreed" that the shortage of human resource had a negative impact on the agency's financial performance during 2015-2020. An additional 16.7% "Disagreed," indicating a portion of participants who did not attribute financial performance issues solely to staffing constraints. Satisfaction with the agency's financial management and resource allocation is an important aspect of financial performance. The analysis demonstrates that 41.7% of respondents "Disagreed" and 33.3% "Disagreed" that they were satisfied with the agency's financial management and resource allocation during 2015-2020. Additionally, 8.3% "Agreed" and 4.2% "Strongly Agreed," indicating a portion of participants who were satisfied with the financial management and resource allocation. The impact of financial constraints due to staffing shortages on the acquisition of essential medical supplies and equipment is a significant concern. The analysis indicates that 33.3% of respondents "Agreed" and 25% "Strongly Agreed" that financial constraints due to staffing shortages affected the acquisition of essential medical supplies and equipment during the specified years. Furthermore, 20.8% "Disagreed," suggesting that some participants did not attribute acquisition challenges solely to personnel shortages. The link between staffing shortages and



## **Original Article**

increased costs or inefficiencies in agency operations is pivotal. The analysis reveals that 29.2% of respondents "Agreed" and 16.7% "Strongly Agreed" that lack of staffing led to increased costs or inefficiencies in agency operations during the specified years. Moreover, 12.5% "Disagreed," suggesting that some participants did not attribute increased costs or inefficiencies solely to personnel shortages.

The table shows that respondents perceived various effects of personnel inadequacy on financial performance, financial management satisfaction, acquisition challenges, and operational costs. These findings emphasize the importance of addressing staffing challenges to enhance financial performance and resource utilization efficiency.

### **Summary of Major Findings**

The following summarizes the major findings that emerged from the analysis:

- i. Regarding the link between human resource inadequacy and training/development, the analysis revealed that most respondents felt staff shortages hindered their participation in training programs and limited professional growth opportunities. This suggests personnel inadequacy restricted employee training and advancement.
- ii. On the impact of human resource inadequacy on financial performance, the analysis indicated that most respondents felt personnel shortages negatively affected financial management, resource allocation, acquisition of supplies/equipment, and operational efficiency. This implies that inadequate staffing compromised the agency's financial performance.

### **Recommendations**

To address the challenges of human resource inadequacy, the study recommends:

- i. Improved funding and investments into health worker training, compensation and benefits to attract and retain personnel.
- ii. Development of strong leadership and governance practices for effective human.

### **REFERENCES**

- Ademolekun, L. (1983). *Public Administration: A Nigeria and Comparative Perspective*. New York: Longman Inc.
- Adeniji, F. O., Adejobi, A. O., & Dedekere, A. A. (2019). Insufficient health workers compromise utilization of services and quality of care in primary health centers: A case of North Central Nigeria. *Journal of Healthcare Management*, 17(3), 45-58.
- Cole, G. A. (2002). *Personnel and Human Resource Management*. Fifth Edition. Book Power. London.
- Efe, S. I., & Efe, C. O. (2014). Inadequate staffing and its impact on healthcare service quality: Perspectives from Southern Nigeria. *Nigerian Journal of Healthcare Quality*, 5(2), 8794.
- Ezeani, E. O. and Nwanko, B. C. (2002). *Human Resources Management in the Local Government System in Nigeria* (eds.) Nsukka: AP Express Publishers.

## **Original Article**

- Ibrahim, A., Audu, O., & Tolu, L. B. (2015). Inadequate workforce numbers compromise financial performance in tertiary hospitals: A study from Benue State. *Health Economics Review*, 25(2), 18-27.
- Igwe, I. A., Agbasi, N., & Ezediegwu, A. O. (2019). Linking understaffing to absenteeism, productivity, and work-life balance among primary care workers in Ebonyi State. *Journal of Health Management*, 21(2), 257-268.
- Ndiomu, C. B. (1992). *Human Resources Development and Utilization in the Nigerian Armed Forces* in Yahaya, A. D. and C. I. Akinyele (eds) *Human Resources Development and Utilization, Policies and Issues*: Lagos: Safani Books Ltd.
- Nwachkwu, C. C. (1988). *Management: Theory and Practice*, Onitsha: African-Feb Publishers Limited.
- Ofoegbu, R. (1985). *Personnel Recruitment and Management*. In H. N. Nwosu (ed) *Problems of Nigeria Administration*. Enugu: Furth Dimension Publishing Company.
- Okoli, J. C. (2000). "Organization of Personnel Functions at the Local Government Level".
- Paper Presented at Zonal Workshop on "Effective Human Resources Management, 9<sup>th</sup> to 11<sup>th</sup> August, 2000.
- Onah, F. O. (2008). *Human Resource Management*. 2<sup>nd</sup> Edition. Enugu: John Jacob's Classic Publishers Ltd.
- Pigors, P. and C. A. Myers (1987). *Personnel Administration: a Point of View and a Method*, Auckland McGraw-Hill International Book Company.
- Sanders, M., Lewis, P., & Thornhill, A. (2012). *Research methods for business students*, 4th eds. Essex England: Pearson Education Limited.
- Ubeku, A. K. (1975). *Personnel Management in Nigeria*. Benin City: Ethiope Publishing Corporation.
- Ulrich, D. (2005). *The Future of Human Resources Management*. Virginia: John Wiley and Sons Incorporated.